

# Why?

**Please help, these are only surmise answers, if you have any suggestions for the answer to these questions please e-mail [info@gattonmurders.com](mailto:info@gattonmurders.com)**

**Q.** Why Was The Bullet Casing Found In The Blood Under The Horse's Head? The Horse Fell To Its Right And Would Have Been Shot Head On And Falling To Its Side The Head Would Land Several Feet From Its Killer And The Casing Would Be Ejected To The Right Hand Side Placing It Even Further Away From The Horses Head.

**A.**

[It was placed there on purpose by somebody other than the killer?](#)

[The killer placed it in the blood? One would imagine the killer would not leave evidence?](#)

**Q.** Why After Traveling All The Way To Gatton For The Dance They Didn't Even Enquire Why It Wasn't On?

**A.**

[Wanted to get back to the paddock for an arranged meeting?](#)

**Q.** Why Were Michael And Ellen Buried Side By Side And Nora 2½ Metres Away?

**A.**

[No room with the others?](#)

[Stigma?](#)

**Q.** Why Did Arrell Report A Large Amount Of Blood On The Blanket Beneath Nora, Yet Dr. Orr Does Not Mention Any Blood On The Blanket At All?

**A.**

[A different blanket sent to Brisbane?](#)

**Q.** If Rape, Why So Many Fingernail Scratches? Scratches Were Found On The Labia Of Ellen Around To The Anus Of Both Girls.

**A.**

[Made to appear as if rape was the motive?](#)

**Q.** Why No Barking Dogs?

**A.**

[They were inside where they could be kept quiet?](#)

**Katie Murphy**

[There were four dogs at the house, and they were in the habit of barking at the boys when they came home late until they spoke to them.](#)

**John Murphy**

[He went away to Tent Hill, and returned about 10.30. He did not notice that the dogs barked. He went to bed.](#)

**Jeremiah Murphy**

[When he reached home he did not see the pony that was usually running about the premises. This beast was not easy to catch when it had been out for some time. The horse could have been there, without witness having seen it. There was one dog about the place.](#)

**Q.** Why Did M'Neill Supposedly Come To Gatton For A Long Weekend With No Change Of Clothes. All That Was Found By Patrick Murphy Was A Spare Pair Of Trousers?

A.

Had he disposed of his change of clothes?

Q. Why Did M'Neill Wear His Going Out Clothes When He Went To Look For The Victims?

A.

Had he disposed of his change of shirt?

Q. Why Didn't The Person At The Sliprails Mind Being Seen?

A.

Murder not intended?

Nothing to do with the crime?

Q. Why If Murder And Rape Was Intended Was No Rope Taken To The Scene By The Killer?

A.

Q. Why Wasn't Anyone Gagged If Murder And Rape Was Intended?

A.

Q. Why Wasn't M'Neill Or Anyone Else Caught?

A.

Lack of evidence?

Galbraith helped?

Q. Why Were Their Feet Facing Westward?

A.

Facing Westbrook a small clue left by M'Neill?

To get the best light for the abortion?

Coincidence?

Irish Catholic tradition?

Q. Why That Paddock?

A.

Close to town?

Unoccupied?

Close to where the abortionists lived?

Not too far from home?

Easily accessed?

Q. Why Did The Family Do All They Could To Keep Polly M'Neill Away From The Court?

A.

She knew what happened and was thinking of spilling the beans?

Q. Why Wouldn't Polly M'Neill Swear Her Husband Did Not Leave The House?

A.

He did in fact leave early in the morning?

Q. Why Were All Three Bodies Exhumed When They Were Only Supposedly Looking For A Bullet In Michaels Head?

A.

They wanted to see if the girls were ravished?

They wanted to see if the girls were pregnant?

Looking for the imprint?

Q. Why Wasn't The Rug Presented For Viewing At The Inquiry?

A.

The police didn't want it viewed?

Q. Why Were No Flies Reported On The Bodies It Only Takes A Few Hours Before Flies Lay Eggs On A Dead Body? Only Ants.

A.

Bodies still fresh?

Bodies had some kind of repellent nature (ether)?

No flies in Gattin?

Q. Why Was Urquhart So Confident Burgess Was Their Man?

A.

The material that made the facsimile on the clothing of the victims and Michael's wrist matched his clothing material? (Prison Kersey Cloth).

Identification?

Burgess prior history?

Q. Why No Tracks Made By M'Neill?

A.

M'Neill and Robert Smith were there early in the morning and he could not bring himself to going in again alone?

M'Neill did not go anywhere near the bodies, as proven by the lack of tracks, he was at the bottom of the paddock maybe looking for something else?

A thrown useless gun maybe?

A thrown empty bottle?

Q. Why Did M'Neill Come Up On Norah's Left Side, Which Would Be From The South, When If He Came Via The Track As He Said, He Should Have Come Up On Her Right From The North?

A.

He didn't enter the paddock at all that morning about 9:00 am as he already knew what was at the scene as he had been there only a few hours earlier.

This is proven by the fact there were no prints made by him other than the triangular ones going to and from the scene, made by him earlier that morning when he killed the trio and the horse.

Q. Why Did Patrick Ride At A Pace Which Allows Arrell And Connolly To Catch Him Up, Yet Even Though It Is Evident He Knows Connolly Intimately He Does Not Let Them Catch Right Up In Order To Join Them, But Stays A Chain In Front Of Them, Then After Meeting Up With The Victims, Arrell Passes Him And The Victims, He Then Hastens His Pace And Passes Arrell Before He Gets Home?

A.

Could it be Arrell's movements are being closely watched?

Q. Why Take M'Neill's Dog Cart?

A.

Small enough to travel along the track?

Q. Why Did Connolly Send The Telegram At 11:50 To Constable Dan Murphy And Not One Of The Family, Plus Arranged To Bring Patrick Home?

A.

Q. Why Wasn't Connolly Questioned At Any Of The Inquiries?

A.

Q. Why Kill The Horse?

A.

M'Neill needed to test the gun that had been through a fire and been cut down and fashioned into a pistol.

To help conceal the true motive for the crime?

Killed by accident?

Michael kneel down again and in the heat of the moment he was shot behind the ear, as he didn't fall or was still alive, he was consequently bashed, to ensure death?

To stop them using it to escape?

Q. Where Did The Gun Come From?

A.

Borrowed from Day without his knowledge?

Borrowed from Day with his knowledge?

Used by Day at the scene?

Father Daniel Snr?

Brother Dan Jnr?

M'Neill, the gun that had been through a fire and been cut down and fashioned into a pistol?

Robert Smith?

Q. Why Wasn't The Mysterious Bob Smith Questioned? (Who the hell was he?)

A.

Q. What Was The Purpose Of The Screwed Up Piece Of Gatton Agricultural College Paper?

A.

Used as a bottle stop for anaesthetic stolen from the college by Patrick?

Used as a bottle stop for anaesthetic stolen from Westbrook by Michael?

Used as a bottle stop for anaesthetic bought from Mr. R. James, the Gatton chemist, who quickly dismisses the administration of anaesthetic as a reason the bodies were so limp?

Used as a pipe stop?

Q. Why Was The In Memoriam Notice At The Scene?

A.

To emphasize the risk Norah was taking?

Q. Why Were The Lunny Letters Near The Scene?

A.

To prove the abortionist knew what he/she was doing by showing the hospital letterhead?

Q. Who Was The Father Of The Child If It Was A Botched Abortion?

A.

Robert Smith?

M'Neill?

Michael Murphy?

Michael Connolly?

Dan Murphy Sen.?

Q. Why Did The Mother Mary Murphy Pray More For The Killers Than The Victims?

A.

Kismet?

She knew the killer(s) and why it was done?

Q. Why Didn't Dan Murphy Sen. Go To The Site Of The Murders?

A.

Q. Why Did Dan Murphy Sen. Say I Am Glad They Went To Church On Christmas Day?

A.

Q. Why Did Dan Murphy Sen. Ask Were They Shot? (As If He Already Knew That).

A.

Q. Why Did M'Neill Only Buy Gifts For The 2 Murdered Girls And Not The Rest Of The Family?

A.

Q. Why Did M'Neill Ask For The Chance Of A Pound When It Was Clear He Had Money As He Paid Back The 10 Shillings He Borrowed In Toowoomba?

A.

He wanted to see how much money he had in his purse?

Q. Why Didn't M'Neill And Michael Murphy Travel And Arrive Together In M'Neill's Cart On Christmas Eve When They Came The Same Way And From The Same Place?

A.

Q. Why Were They Buried So Quickly? Even Before The Detectives Could Check For Evidence?

A.

Q. Why Is Day So Apathetic?

A.

Could it be he had absolutely nothing to do with the doings and had nothing to fear at all and was merely made an unfortunate scapegoat at a later date?

Q. Why Wasn't Day Pursued When Later On He Supposedly Became A Prime Suspect?

A.

He had no clothing of the particular type being sought?

The police knew he was not involved?

Q. Why Did Urquhart Ask Day To Look In On Burgess When He Left Gatton And Went To Toowoomba. There Was Nothing To Suggest Day Knew Him And By This Time It Was Clear Burgess Was Nowhere Near Gatton At The Time Of The Crime And Was Completely Innocent Of It?

A.

Back To Gatton Murders Homepage

<http://www.gattonmurders.com/page1.php>